

Learning to Form Groups in Public Goods: Supplemental Materials

Ahn, Isaac and Salmon

These are screen captures of most of the screens subjects see as they go through the help system. Follow the pictures are the tables shown to subjects explaining the payoff structure.

This shows the investment choice screen.

Period
Trial 1 of 1

Remaining time [sec]: 110

Your participant number is: 1

Your Group is: C

Number of members in your group: 6

You have 15 tokens.

Invest this many tokens in the group account:

All tokens not invested in the group account are invested in your individual account.

Individual Account

If you invested this many tokens in your individual account: 12

Your individual account tokens would yield...

To you: 6.00

The cost to you: None

Your total payoff from your individual account: 6.00

To each member of your group (other than you): 0.00

Group Account

If you invested this many tokens in the group account: 3

Your group account tokens would yield...

To you: 4.50

The cost to you: 1.00

Your total payoff from the group account: 3.50

To each member of your group (other than you): 4.50

Your total net payoff (Individual Acct. + Group Acct.) would be: 9.50

NOTE: Your actual total payoff will be this total net payoff plus an amount determined by the amount of tokens the other members of your group invest into the group account.

Results from investment choice under aggregate information treatment.

Period: Trial 1 of 1 Remaining time [sec]: 23

Your participant number is: 1

Results of this round

| | | | |
|---|--|---|--|
| Your Group is | Number of Group Members (including you) | Your Investment in the Group Account | Your Investment in Individual Account: |
| C | 6 | 3 | 12 |
| Your Individual Account Earnings | Your Net Group Account Earnings from Your Investment | Your Group Account Earnings from Other Members' Investments | TOTAL PROFIT THIS ROUND |
| 6.00 | 3.50 | 43.50 | 53.00 |
| Total Investment by All Members (including yourself) into Your Group's Account: | | 32 | |

Continue

Screen asking if subject wishes to change groups under aggregate info treatment.

Period: Trial 1 of 1 Remaining time [sec]: 178

Your participant number is: 1

| Number of Group Members | Average Investment in Group Account Per Person (Number of Members in Group) | | | | |
|-------------------------|---|--------|--------|-----|-----|
| | t-1 | t-2 | t-3 | t-4 | t-5 |
| Group A: 1 | 1 (1) | 3 (2) | 0 (1) | | |
| Group B: 2 | 5 (2) | 10 (1) | 10 (1) | | |
| Group C: 6 | 5 (6) | 6 (5) | 10 (1) | | |
| Group D: 0 | | | 1 (1) | | |
| Group E: 0 | | | 4 (1) | | |
| Group F: 3 | 5 (3) | 4 (4) | 7 (1) | | |
| Group G: 0 | | | 7 (1) | | |
| Group H: 0 | | | 5 (1) | | |
| Group I: 0 | | | 2 (1) | | |
| Group J: 0 | | | 6 (1) | | |
| Group K: 0 | | | 7 (1) | | |
| Group L: 0 | | | 3 (1) | | |

Your current group is: C

Do you wish to switch groups? Yes No

OK

Screen asking those subjects who wished to switch groups, what group they wish to move to.

Period: Trial 1 of 1 Remaining time [sec]: 179

Your participant number is: 1

You may move to any group, A through L, even if that group currently has no members listed below.

Summary of Investments into Group Accounts

| Remaining Number of Group Members | Average Per-Person Investment (Number of Members in Group) | | | | |
|-----------------------------------|--|--------|--------|-----|-----|
| | t-1 | t-2 | t-3 | t-4 | t-5 |
| Group A: 0 | 1 (1) | 3 (2) | 0 (1) | | |
| Group B: 1 | 5 (2) | 10 (1) | 10 (1) | | |
| Group C: 3 | 5 (6) | 6 (5) | 10 (1) | | |
| Group D: 0 | | | 1 (1) | | |
| Group E: 0 | | | 4 (1) | | |
| Group F: 2 | 5 (3) | 4 (4) | 7 (1) | | |
| Group G: 0 | | | 7 (1) | | |
| Group H: 0 | | | 5 (1) | | |
| Group I: 0 | | | 2 (1) | | |
| Group J: 0 | | | 6 (1) | | |
| Group K: 0 | | | 7 (1) | | |
| Group L: 0 | | | 3 (1) | | |

Your old group was: C

Please type the letter of the group (A through L) you wish to move to:

OK

In voting treatment, subjects who remained in a group would see a screen such as this if anyone applied for entry.

Period: Trial 1 of 1 Remaining time [sec]: 178

Your participant number is: 1

Prospective additions to your group are listed below. Please cast a yes or no vote for each candidate.

| Participant # | Investment (Group Size) t-1 | Investment (Group Size) t-2 | Investment (Group Size) t-3 | Investment (Group Size) t-4 | Investment (Group Size) t-5 | Your Vote |
|---------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|--|
| 11 | 8 (3) | 0 (4) | 7 (1) | | | No <input type="radio"/> Yes <input type="radio"/> |
| 7 | 7 (2) | 10 (1) | 10 (1) | | | No <input type="radio"/> Yes <input type="radio"/> |

Please vote Yes or No for each prospective member.
Then, click OK to submit your votes.

OK

Effect of Your Choices on Your Payoff

| Possible Allocations | | Earnings From | Earnings From Group | Cost of | Net Earnings to You |
|----------------------|-----------|--------------------|---------------------|---------------|---------------------|
| Group Acc | Indiv Acc | Individual Account | Account | Investment to | |
| 0 | 15 | 7.50 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 7.50 + Y |
| 1 | 14 | 7.00 | 1.50 | 0.04 | 8.46 + Y |
| 2 | 13 | 6.50 | 3.00 | 0.30 | 9.20 + Y |
| 3 | 12 | 6.00 | 4.50 | 1.00 | 9.50 + Y |
| 4 | 11 | 5.50 | 6.00 | 2.37 | 9.13 + Y |
| 5 | 10 | 5.00 | 7.50 | 4.63 | 7.87 + Y |
| 6 | 9 | 4.50 | 9.00 | 8.00 | 5.50 + Y |
| 7 | 8 | 4.00 | 10.50 | 12.70 | 1.80 + Y |
| 8 | 7 | 3.50 | 12.00 | 18.96 | -3.46 + Y |
| 9 | 6 | 3.00 | 13.50 | 27.00 | -10.50 + Y |
| 10 | 5 | 2.50 | 15.00 | 37.04 | -19.54 + Y |
| 11 | 4 | 2.00 | 16.50 | 49.30 | -30.80 + Y |
| 12 | 3 | 1.50 | 18.00 | 64.00 | -44.50 + Y |
| 13 | 2 | 1.00 | 19.50 | 81.37 | -60.87 + Y |
| 14 | 1 | 0.50 | 21.00 | 101.63 | -80.13 + Y |
| 15 | 0 | 0.00 | 22.50 | 125.00 | -102.50 + Y |

* - The "Y" stands for the sum of all investments by other members of your group to the group account multiplied by 1.5.

Effect of Choices of Group Members on Your Payoffs

| | Number of Tokens You Invested Into Group Account | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|-----|--|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|---------|
| | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 |
| 0 | 7.50 | 8.46 | 9.20 | 9.50 | 9.13 | 7.87 | 5.50 | 1.80 | -3.46 | -10.50 | -19.54 | -30.80 | -44.50 | -60.87 | -80.13 | -102.50 |
| 5 | 15.00 | 15.96 | 16.70 | 17.00 | 16.63 | 15.37 | 13.00 | 9.30 | 4.04 | -3.00 | -12.04 | -23.30 | -37.00 | -53.37 | -72.63 | -95.00 |
| 10 | 22.50 | 23.46 | 24.20 | 24.50 | 24.13 | 22.87 | 20.50 | 16.80 | 11.54 | 4.50 | -4.54 | -15.80 | -29.50 | -45.87 | -65.13 | -87.50 |
| 15 | 30.00 | 30.96 | 31.70 | 32.00 | 31.63 | 30.37 | 28.00 | 24.30 | 19.04 | 12.00 | 2.96 | -8.30 | -22.00 | -38.37 | -57.63 | -80.00 |
| 20 | 37.50 | 38.46 | 39.20 | 39.50 | 39.13 | 37.87 | 35.50 | 31.80 | 26.54 | 19.50 | 10.46 | -0.80 | -14.50 | -30.87 | -50.13 | -72.50 |
| 25 | 45.00 | 45.96 | 46.70 | 47.00 | 46.63 | 45.37 | 43.00 | 39.30 | 34.04 | 27.00 | 17.96 | 6.70 | -7.00 | -23.37 | -42.63 | -65.00 |
| 30 | 52.50 | 53.46 | 54.20 | 54.50 | 54.13 | 52.87 | 50.50 | 46.80 | 41.54 | 34.50 | 25.46 | 14.20 | 0.50 | -15.87 | -35.13 | -57.50 |
| 35 | 60.00 | 60.96 | 61.70 | 62.00 | 61.63 | 60.37 | 58.00 | 54.30 | 49.04 | 42.00 | 32.96 | 21.70 | 8.00 | -8.37 | -27.63 | -50.00 |
| 40 | 67.50 | 68.46 | 69.20 | 69.50 | 69.13 | 67.87 | 65.50 | 61.80 | 56.54 | 49.50 | 40.46 | 29.20 | 15.50 | -0.87 | -20.13 | -42.50 |
| 45 | 75.00 | 75.96 | 76.70 | 77.00 | 76.63 | 75.37 | 73.00 | 69.30 | 64.04 | 57.00 | 47.96 | 36.70 | 23.00 | 6.63 | -12.63 | -35.00 |
| 50 | 82.50 | 83.46 | 84.20 | 84.50 | 84.13 | 82.87 | 80.50 | 76.80 | 71.54 | 64.50 | 55.46 | 44.20 | 30.50 | 14.13 | -5.13 | -27.50 |
| 55 | 90.00 | 90.96 | 91.70 | 92.00 | 91.63 | 90.37 | 88.00 | 84.30 | 79.04 | 72.00 | 62.96 | 51.70 | 38.00 | 21.63 | 2.37 | -20.00 |
| 60 | 97.50 | 98.46 | 99.20 | 99.50 | 99.13 | 97.87 | 95.50 | 91.80 | 86.54 | 79.50 | 70.46 | 59.20 | 45.50 | 29.13 | 9.87 | -12.50 |
| 65 | 105.00 | 105.96 | 106.70 | 107.00 | 106.63 | 105.37 | 103.00 | 99.30 | 94.04 | 87.00 | 77.96 | 66.70 | 53.00 | 36.63 | 17.37 | -5.00 |
| 70 | 112.50 | 113.46 | 114.20 | 114.50 | 114.13 | 112.87 | 110.50 | 106.80 | 101.54 | 94.50 | 85.46 | 74.20 | 60.50 | 44.13 | 24.87 | 2.50 |
| 75 | 120.00 | 120.96 | 121.70 | 122.00 | 121.63 | 120.37 | 118.00 | 114.30 | 109.04 | 102.00 | 92.96 | 81.70 | 68.00 | 51.63 | 32.37 | 10.00 |
| 80 | 127.50 | 128.46 | 129.20 | 129.50 | 129.13 | 127.87 | 125.50 | 121.80 | 116.54 | 109.50 | 100.46 | 89.20 | 75.50 | 59.13 | 39.87 | 17.50 |
| 85 | 135.00 | 135.96 | 136.70 | 137.00 | 136.63 | 135.37 | 133.00 | 129.30 | 124.04 | 117.00 | 107.96 | 96.70 | 83.00 | 66.63 | 47.37 | 25.00 |
| 90 | 142.50 | 143.46 | 144.20 | 144.50 | 144.13 | 142.87 | 140.50 | 136.80 | 131.54 | 124.50 | 115.46 | 104.20 | 90.50 | 74.13 | 54.87 | 32.50 |
| 95 | 150.00 | 150.96 | 151.70 | 152.00 | 151.63 | 150.37 | 148.00 | 144.30 | 139.04 | 132.00 | 122.96 | 111.70 | 98.00 | 81.63 | 62.37 | 40.00 |
| 100 | 157.50 | 158.46 | 159.20 | 159.50 | 159.13 | 157.87 | 155.50 | 151.80 | 146.54 | 139.50 | 130.46 | 119.20 | 105.50 | 89.13 | 69.87 | 47.50 |
| 105 | 165.00 | 165.96 | 166.70 | 167.00 | 166.63 | 165.37 | 163.00 | 159.30 | 154.04 | 147.00 | 137.96 | 126.70 | 113.00 | 96.63 | 77.37 | 55.00 |
| 110 | 172.50 | 173.46 | 174.20 | 174.50 | 174.13 | 172.87 | 170.50 | 166.80 | 161.54 | 154.50 | 145.46 | 134.20 | 120.50 | 104.13 | 84.87 | 62.50 |
| 115 | 180.00 | 180.96 | 181.70 | 182.00 | 181.63 | 180.37 | 178.00 | 174.30 | 169.04 | 162.00 | 152.96 | 141.70 | 128.00 | 111.63 | 92.37 | 70.00 |
| 120 | 187.50 | 188.46 | 189.20 | 189.50 | 189.13 | 187.87 | 185.50 | 181.80 | 176.54 | 169.50 | 160.46 | 149.20 | 135.50 | 119.13 | 99.87 | 77.50 |
| 125 | 195.00 | 195.96 | 196.70 | 197.00 | 196.63 | 195.37 | 193.00 | 189.30 | 184.04 | 177.00 | 167.96 | 156.70 | 143.00 | 126.63 | 107.37 | 85.00 |
| 130 | 202.50 | 203.46 | 204.20 | 204.50 | 204.13 | 202.87 | 200.50 | 196.80 | 191.54 | 184.50 | 175.46 | 164.20 | 150.50 | 134.13 | 114.87 | 92.50 |
| 135 | 210.00 | 210.96 | 211.70 | 212.00 | 211.63 | 210.37 | 208.00 | 204.30 | 199.04 | 192.00 | 182.96 | 171.70 | 158.00 | 141.63 | 122.37 | 100.00 |
| 140 | 217.50 | 218.46 | 219.20 | 219.50 | 219.13 | 217.87 | 215.50 | 211.80 | 206.54 | 199.50 | 190.46 | 179.20 | 165.50 | 149.13 | 129.87 | 107.50 |
| 145 | 225.00 | 225.96 | 226.70 | 227.00 | 226.63 | 225.37 | 223.00 | 219.30 | 214.04 | 207.00 | 197.96 | 186.70 | 173.00 | 156.63 | 137.37 | 115.00 |
| 150 | 232.50 | 233.46 | 234.20 | 234.50 | 234.13 | 232.87 | 230.50 | 226.80 | 221.54 | 214.50 | 205.46 | 194.20 | 180.50 | 164.13 | 144.87 | 122.50 |
| 155 | 240.00 | 240.96 | 241.70 | 242.00 | 241.63 | 240.37 | 238.00 | 234.30 | 229.04 | 222.00 | 212.96 | 201.70 | 188.00 | 171.63 | 152.37 | 130.00 |
| 160 | 247.50 | 248.46 | 249.20 | 249.50 | 249.13 | 247.87 | 245.50 | 241.80 | 236.54 | 229.50 | 220.46 | 209.20 | 195.50 | 179.13 | 159.87 | 137.50 |
| 165 | 255.00 | 255.96 | 256.70 | 257.00 | 256.63 | 255.37 | 253.00 | 249.30 | 244.04 | 237.00 | 227.96 | 216.70 | 203.00 | 186.63 | 167.37 | 145.00 |

Total Investment of Rest of Your Group into Group Account

Effect of your Choices on Rest of Group

| Possible Allocations | | Net Earnings to You | Net Earnings Generated to Rest of Group | | | | | | | | | | |
|----------------------|-----------|---------------------|---|-------|-------|-------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|
| Group Acc | Indiv Acc | | n = 2 | n=3 | n = 4 | n = 5 | n = 6 | n=7 | n = 8 | n = 9 | n = 10 | n = 11 | n = 12 |
| 0 | 15 | $7.50 + Y$ | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| 1 | 14 | $8.46 + Y$ | 1.50 | 3.00 | 4.50 | 6.00 | 7.50 | 9.00 | 10.50 | 12.00 | 13.50 | 15.00 | 16.50 |
| 2 | 13 | $9.20 + Y$ | 3.00 | 6.00 | 9.00 | 12.00 | 15.00 | 18.00 | 21.00 | 24.00 | 27.00 | 30.00 | 33.00 |
| 3 | 12 | $9.50 + Y$ | 4.50 | 9.00 | 13.50 | 18.00 | 22.50 | 27.00 | 31.50 | 36.00 | 40.50 | 45.00 | 49.50 |
| 4 | 11 | $9.13 + Y$ | 6.00 | 12.00 | 18.00 | 24.00 | 30.00 | 36.00 | 42.00 | 48.00 | 54.00 | 60.00 | 66.00 |
| 5 | 10 | $7.87 + Y$ | 7.50 | 15.00 | 22.50 | 30.00 | 37.50 | 45.00 | 52.50 | 60.00 | 67.50 | 75.00 | 82.50 |
| 6 | 9 | $5.50 + Y$ | 9.00 | 18.00 | 27.00 | 36.00 | 45.00 | 54.00 | 63.00 | 72.00 | 81.00 | 90.00 | 99.00 |
| 7 | 8 | $1.80 + Y$ | 10.50 | 21.00 | 31.50 | 42.00 | 52.50 | 63.00 | 73.50 | 84.00 | 94.50 | 105.00 | 115.50 |
| 8 | 7 | $-3.46 + Y$ | 12.00 | 24.00 | 36.00 | 48.00 | 60.00 | 72.00 | 84.00 | 96.00 | 108.00 | 120.00 | 132.00 |
| 9 | 6 | $-10.50 + Y$ | 13.50 | 27.00 | 40.50 | 54.00 | 67.50 | 81.00 | 94.50 | 108.00 | 121.50 | 135.00 | 148.50 |
| 10 | 5 | $-19.54 + Y$ | 15.00 | 30.00 | 45.00 | 60.00 | 75.00 | 90.00 | 105.00 | 120.00 | 135.00 | 150.00 | 165.00 |
| 11 | 4 | $-30.80 + Y$ | 16.50 | 33.00 | 49.50 | 66.00 | 82.50 | 99.00 | 115.50 | 132.00 | 148.50 | 165.00 | 181.50 |
| 12 | 3 | $-44.50 + Y$ | 18.00 | 36.00 | 54.00 | 72.00 | 90.00 | 108.00 | 126.00 | 144.00 | 162.00 | 180.00 | 198.00 |
| 13 | 2 | $-60.87 + Y$ | 19.50 | 39.00 | 58.50 | 78.00 | 97.50 | 117.00 | 136.50 | 156.00 | 175.50 | 195.00 | 214.50 |
| 14 | 1 | $-80.13 + Y$ | 21.00 | 42.00 | 63.00 | 84.00 | 105.00 | 126.00 | 147.00 | 168.00 | 189.00 | 210.00 | 231.00 |
| 15 | 0 | $-102.50 + Y$ | 22.50 | 45.00 | 67.50 | 90.00 | 112.50 | 135.00 | 157.50 | 180.00 | 202.50 | 225.00 | 247.50 |