Terrestrial sources as the primary delivery mechanism of mercury to the oceans across the Toarcian Oceanic Anoxic Event (Early Jurassic)

T.R. Them II a,*, C.H. Jagoe b, A.H. Caruthers c, B.C. Gill d, S.E. Grasby e, D.R. Gröcke f, R. Yin g, J.D. Owens h,1

a Department of Geology and Environmental Geosciences, College of Charleston, Charleston, SC 29424, USA
b School of the Environment, Florida A&M University, Tallahassee, FL 32307, USA
c Department of Geosciences, Western Michigan University, Kalamazoo, MI 49006, USA
d Department of Geosciences, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, Blacksburg, VA 24061, USA
e Geological Survey of Canada, Natural Resources Canada, Calgary, Alberta T2L 2A7, Canada
f Department of Earth Sciences, Durham University, Durham, DH1 3LE, UK
gh State Key Laboratory of Ore Deposit Geochemistry, Institute of Geochemistry, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Guiyang 550002, China
bi National High Magnetic Field Laboratory, Florida State University, Tallahassee, FL 32310, USA

1. Introduction

Mercury (Hg) enrichments have recently been identified as a novel proxy to track past events of large-scale volcanism (e.g., Sanei et al., 2012). In the geologic record, the emplacements of large igneous provinces (LIPs) are hypothesized as the lynchpin behind many first- and second-order mass extinction events (e.g., Courtillot, 1999) and other episodes of environmental perturbation. It is thought that volcanic outgassing during LIP emplacement catalyzes a cascade of environmental and biogeochemical feedbacks, which has a dramatic impact on the biosphere (e.g., Courtillot, 1999; Bond and Wignall, 2014; Bond and Grasby, 2017). One of the fundamental issues facing the correlation of sedimentological, geochemical, and biological records is unequivocally linking the timing, magnitude, and effects of LIP activity, because converging geochemical processes can often yield non-unique signals in the sedimentary record.

Numerous studies have applied the Hg proxy to Phanerozoic extinctions and oceanic anoxic events (OAEs) associated with documented or hypothesized LIP emplacements, and have noted contemporaneous Hg concentration ([Hg]) anomalies and/or increases relative to total organic carbon (Hg/TOC; e.g., Sanei et al., 2012; Percival et al., 2015; Thibodeau et al., 2016; Grasby et al., 2017; Scaife et al., 2017; Wang et al., 2018; Fantasia et al., 2018; see SI for a list of all ancient Phanerozoic Hg anomalies linked to volcanic activity). The strong affinity of Hg with organic matter (e.g., Ravichandran, 2004) makes it necessary to report Hg/TOC values

* Corresponding author.
E-mail address: themir@cofc.edu (T.R. Them).

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2018.11.029
0012-821X/Crown Copyright © 2018 Published by Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved.
when identifying Hg anomalies, a standard practice when documenting anthropogenic enrichments in modern sediments (e.g., Fitzgerald et al., 2007). These studies have concluded that LIP injections of CO$_2$, CH$_4$, or SO$_2$ into the atmosphere caused the planet to warm and/or cool, depending on the timescale, which then affected the biosphere through environmental and biogeochemical feedbacks (e.g., Courtillot, 1999; Pálfy and Smith, 2000). These suggested feedbacks may represent extinction mechanisms, so understanding the link between LIPs and biological evolution remains critical to resolving the relationship between global environmental change and life.

The Early Jurassic Toarcian OAE (T-OAE; ~183 Ma) is a well-documented, transient climate event that was potentially triggered by the initial emplacement of the Karoo–Ferrar LIP, and resulted in global-scale environmental change, culminating in marine mass extinction/s. The T-OAE is characterized by a globally synchronous negative carbon isotope excursion (N-CIE) that represents a major change in the carbon cycle (e.g., Hesselbo et al., 2000; Izumi et al., 2012; Them et al., 2017a; cf. Them et al., 2018). Other paleoenvironmental changes associated with the T-OAE are an acceleration of the global hydrological cycle and rates of continental weathering (e.g., Percival et al., 2016; Them et al., 2017b; Izumi et al., 2018), increased biomass burning as a result of wildfires (e.g., Baker et al., 2017), carbonate platform demise (e.g., Trecchi et al., 2012; Han et al., 2018), global oceanic deoxygenation (e.g., Them et al., 2018), widespread pyrite burial due to expansion of euxinic (anoxic and sulfidic) conditions (e.g., Gill et al., 2011), and a multi-phased marine mass extinction interval (e.g., Caruthers et al., 2013).

Constraining the timing and magnitude of the influence of the Karoo–Ferrar LIP (e.g. Pálfy and Smith, 2000; Seil et al., 2014) is pivotal to our understanding of the effect of massive volcanic eruptions on environmental changes and biological extinction/turndown during this time. Previously published Pliensbachian–Toarcian Hg datasets show variable Hg enrichments (i.e., enrichment magnitudes and asynchronous stratigraphic enrichment variabilities) during the T-OAE interval (e.g., Percival et al., 2015; Fantasia et al., 2018; Fig. 1); these are concurrent, however, with lithological transitions (i.e., carbonates to organic matter-rich shales, mudstones to clay-rich sandstones, or other similar changes). These Hg enrichments are directly linked to volcanogenic Hg emissions associated with the Karoo–Ferrar LIP (e.g., Percival et al., 2015; Fantasia et al., 2018), although other lines of evidence show increased LIP production and global oceanic deoxygenation before the initiation of the classical defined T-OAE interval (e.g., Moulin et al., 2017; Them et al., 2018).

2. Mercury cycle

Today, Hg is emitted to the atmosphere from several sources including the oceans, biomass burning, rock weathering, soil erosion, volcanism, and anthropogenic activities (Fig. 2). Elemental Hg (Hg$^0$) is the dominant form of Hg in the atmosphere. The residence time of atmospheric Hg$^0$ is 0.5–1 yr (e.g., Selin, 2009; Driscoll et al., 2013), which is less than the mixing time of the hemispheres (ca. 1–1.5 yr), and therefore it can be globally transported relatively rapidly (e.g., Schuster et al., 2002). Atmospheric Hg$^0$ is removed through two pathways: [1] transformation to oxidized Hg(II) species, which are particle reactive and soluble, and easily deposited through wet/dry deposition; and [2] direct uptake by vegetation and soils followed by oxidation. Mercury enters the ocean primarily through direct atmospheric deposition and terrestrial riverine runoff (e.g., Holmes et al., 2010; Amos et al., 2014). Mercury in major rivers is particulate-bound, although it becomes decoupled from lithogenic materials after initial deposition (e.g., Zhu et al., 2018); thus, normalizing Hg to lithogenic tracers (i.e., aluminum and titanium; e.g., Scaife et al., 2017; many others) can be problematic. Approximately 25% of riverine-derived Hg might reach the open ocean, with the majority being deposited in shallow proximal locations such as estuaries and nearshore ocean margins (e.g., Amos et al., 2014). Atmospheric Hg also contains more soluble species (e.g., particulate bound Hg(II)), which can be deposited and then re-volatilized to the atmosphere, similar to Hg(0). Importantly, these processes can recycle initial Hg inputs several times through the environment (e.g., Driscoll et al., 2013) before it ultimately enters the ocean where it is scavenged by organic-rich particles, and sinks to the seabed (as reviewed by Fitzgerald and Lamborg, 2014). This results in an average oceanic/atmospheric residence time — from source to ultimate sink — of ~3 thousand years (e.g., Selin et al., 2008).

While volcanoes are the dominant input to the exogenic Hg cycle on geologic timescales, the cycling of Hg through many intermediate reservoirs (Fig. 2) can make it difficult to identify the primary source(s) of bulk sedimentary Hg (e.g., Driscoll et al., 2013). Enrichments alone (i.e., Hg anomalies relative to pre-anomaly values) have proven to be a tenuous fingerprint for the sources of Hg in the modern, thus several studies have used Hg isotopes. Mercury has seven natural stable isotopes ($^{196}$Hg, $^{198}$Hg, $^{199}$Hg, $^{200}$Hg, $^{201}$Hg, $^{202}$Hg, and $^{204}$Hg), which can be partitioned via mass-
dependent (MDF, reported in $\Delta^{202}$Hg) and/or mass-independent (MIF, reported in $\Delta^{199}$Hg) fractionations during its cycling (e.g., Bergquist and Blum, 2007). To date, large variations of Hg isotopic ratios ($\sim 10\%$ for $\Delta^{202}$Hg and $\Delta^{199}$Hg values) have been reported for natural samples (e.g., Blum et al., 2014). Although $\Delta^{202}$Hg has been used as a source tracer in many case studies, it needs to be cautioned that MDF is ubiquitous and occurs during all biological reactions (e.g., reduction, methylation, demethylation), abiotic chemical reactions (e.g., chemical reduction, photoreduction, oxidation), and physical processes (e.g., volatilization, evaporation, adsorption, and dissolution), which may lead to ambiguous interpretations (reviewed by Blum et al., 2014).

The addition of $\Delta^{199}$Hg signatures greatly increases the usefulness of Hg isotopes because they provide a unique fingerprint of specific pathways. It has been suggested that MDF and MIF signatures can be combined to identify the Hg source(s) in the modern (e.g., Blum et al., 2014) and in the ancient to varying effects (e.g., Thibodeau et al., 2016; Grasby et al., 2017; Gleason et al., 2017; Yin et al., 2017). Plotting $\Delta^{199}$Hg vs. $\Delta^{202}$Hg clusters data of unique process(es) together (see Fig. 1 in Blum et al., 2014). Although modern Hg isotope studies (e.g., Leficariu et al., 2011; Das et al., 2013; Bessinger, 2015) show that there is an overlap in the isotopic composition of natural sources, the MIF signals could be useful in fingerprinting Hg sources (Fig. 2). On geologic timescales, it is suggested that Hg was emitted to the surface environment through volcanic and potentially hydrothermal activities, and these sources have shown $\Delta^{199}$Hg values close to zero (Fig. 2). $\Delta^{199}$Hg anomalies have been predominantly observed on Earth’s surface environment such as soils, sediments, and atmospheric and biological samples, and Hg photoreactions are thought to play the foremost role in the generation of $\Delta^{199}$Hg anomalies in natural samples (e.g., Blum et al., 2014). It is these $\Delta^{199}$Hg differences that may be useful to distinguish between primary and secondary Hg sources.

3. Study sites

Here we investigate the dynamics of the Hg cycle across the T-OAE in two independently constrained anoxic basins from northeastern Panthalassa and the European epeiric seaway (Fig. 1). The first in Alberta, Canada, represents a transect in water depth from proximal (East Tributary) to distal (drill cores 1-35-62-5W6 and 6-32-75-20W6) in the Fernie Formation (Them et al., 2017a, 2017b, 2018). The second represents a semi-restricted locality in the European epeiric sea collected from Dotternhausen Quarry, South German Basin. These regions are ideal localities for testing Hg anomalies, as they both have reducing redox conditions during the study interval (Them et al., 2018). Constraining the local depositional conditions is important to quantify Hg enrichments, as Hg is associated with TOC contents of the sediment and is also redox sensitive (e.g., Ravichandran, 2004; Niessen et al., 2003), which represents the first attempt to do this for the Pliensbachian-Toarcian interval. Additionally, the site with the highest and only Hg/TOC anomaly (East Tributary) was chosen for isotopic analysis to potentially aid in constraining Hg sources as it is the only site suggesting Hg source variability (e.g., Blum et al., 2014; Thibodeau et al., 2016; Grasby et al., 2017; Wang et al., 2018). The sites where no Hg/TOC anomalies were identified were not analyzed for Hg isotopic compositions, as they suggest minimal change in the Hg cycle and confirm the null hypothesis (i.e., there is no change in Hg/TOC across the T-OAE).

4. Methods

4.1. Mercury concentrations

Splits of samples from previous studies of the Pliensbachian and Toarcian stages of the Early Jurassic (e.g., Them et al., 2017a, 2017b, 2018; Gill et al., 2011) were analyzed for Hg mercury concentrations in the School of the Environment at Florida A&M Uni-
iversity. Approximately 50–100 mg of sample powder was added to a measuring boat and placed into a DMA-80 (Milestone Inc., Shelton, CT) and heated in stages. Volatilized Hg was collected by gold amalgamation before being measured via spectral analysis. All samples contained quantifiable mercury concentrations. Data were calibrated using international reference standards (SRM Spinach 1570a, SRM Mussel 2976, BCR-60 Aquatic Plant, and TORT-2 SRM; see Supplementary Information and SI Table 1 for values), which bracketed the full range of mercury concentrations calculated in these geologic samples. TOC values for these samples were previously published (e.g., Them et al., 2017a, 2017b; Dickson et al., 2017). Mercury data collected by this technique delivered the same values as the samples that were chosen for Hg isotopes and calculated using different chemical processing and analytical instrumentation (see below).

4.2. Mercury isotopes (δ²⁰²Hg and Δ¹⁹⁹Hg)

Splits of samples from the East Tributary section of Canada were analyzed for Hg isotopes at the Laboratory of Advanced Environmental Analysis, Hong Kong Polytechnic University. Approximately 0.5 g sample was digested in 5 mL of aqua regia (HCl:HNO₃ = 3:1, v:v) using water bath (95°C) for 1 h. Mercury in the digest solutions were diluted to 0.2 to 0.5 ng mL⁻¹, and the acid concentrations were adjusted to 20% (v/v). Mercury and acid matrices of the bracketing Hg standard (NIST SRM 3133) were matched to the sample solutions. Digests of standard reference materials (MESS-1, ocean sediment) were prepared, and measured in the same way as the samples. UM-Almadén secondary Hg standard solution containing 0.2, 0.5, and 1.0 ng mL⁻¹ of Hg in 20% (v/v) aqua regia was also measured. No statistical differences in Hg isotopic compositions were observed for solutions with different Hg concentrations (see SI Table 1), and the results for UM-Almadén and MESS-1 agreed well with previous studies (e.g., Blum et al., 2014; Blum and Bergquist, 2007; Donovan et al., 2013). Uncertainties in the data reported in this study reflect the larger values of either the external precision of the replication of the UM-Almadén or the measurement uncertainty of MESS-1. The Hg concentration and isotope data are included in the SI data.

Mercury isotope ratios were measured by a Neptune Plus multicollector inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry (MC-ICP-MS). The MC-ICP-MS was equipped with a gas–liquid phase separator and an Apex-Q desolvation unit (Elemental Scientific Inc., USA) for Hg and thallium (Tl) introduction, respectively. Briefly, SnCl₂ was continually pumped along with Hg(II) sample solutions and allowed to mix prior to being introduced to a gas/liquid separator, producing gaseous elemental Hg(0). Using the gas/liquid separator, a relatively simple and dry sample stream contain just Ar and Hg(0) was added to the instrument, which minimized any possible matrix effect. It is possible that the wet digestion may cause incomplete reduction of Hg(II) by SnCl₂, which may cause Hg isotope fractionation. However, this is not the case for our samples. Mercury concentrations of our samples were monitored using the ²⁰²Hg signals of MC-ICP-MS, and the total Hg estimated by ²⁰²Hg signals were 86–107% to that measured by the Hg analyzer at the School of Environment at Florida A&M University (see above). Detailed methods for conducting the MC-ICP-MS analysis were described previously (Geng et al., 2018). The signals for ²⁰²Hg were <0.02 V for acid blanks. The sensitivities of ²⁰²Hg during Hg isotope analysis was 1.4 to 1.7 V per ng mL⁻¹ Hg. Mass dependent fractionation of Hg isotopes is expressed in δ²⁰²Hg notation in units of per mil (%ε) referenced to the NIST-3133 Hg standard (analyzed before and after each sample):

\[
\delta^{202}\text{Hg}(\%\epsilon) = \left(\frac{(^{202}\text{Hg}/^{198}\text{Hg})_{\text{sample}}}{(^{202}\text{Hg}/^{198}\text{Hg})_{\text{standard}}} - 1\right) \times 1000
\]

Mass independent fractionation of Hg isotopes is reported in Δ notation (Δ²⁰²Hg), which describe the difference between the measured δ²⁰²Hg and the theoretically predicted δ²⁰²Hg value using the following formula:

\[
\Delta^{202}\text{Hg} \approx \delta^{202}\text{Hg} \times \beta
\]

where \( \beta \) is equal to 0.2520 for ²⁰⁹Hg, 0.5024 for ²⁰⁰Hg, and 0.7520 for ²⁰¹Hg (e.g., Blum and Bergquist, 2007).

5. Results

In northeastern Panthalassa, the most proximal shallow-water site (East Tributary section; \( n = 36 \)) shows an increase in [Hg] from 0.03 to 0.24 mg/kg (or ppm) and Hg/TOC of 0.02 to 0.05 ([mg/kg]/TOC), with the highest values coincident with the N-CIE interval (Fig. 3). During the N-CIE, δ²⁰²Hg and Δ¹⁹⁹Hg values (\( n = 8 \)) become more negative (−0.5 to −1%ε and −0.1 to −0.2%ε, respectively; Fig. 3). The intermediate water depth site (core 1-35-62-20WS; \( n = 18 \)) shows an [Hg] increase at the base of the N-CIE from one sample, but lacks a corresponding Hg/TOC anomaly due to simultaneous TOC enrichment (Fig. 3). The distal and deepest-water site (core 6-32-78-SW6; \( n = 17 \)) shows a decrease in [Hg] and Hg/TOC across the N-CIE (Fig. 3).

In the European epeiric Sea Dotternhausen section (\( n = 29 \)), a significant increase in [Hg] from ~0.05 to 0.35 mg/kg occurred during the N-CIE, but again lacks a coincident Hg/TOC anomaly as TOC is also enriched (Fig. 4). At this site there are higher Hg/TOC values below the N-CIE, but these reflect extremely low and variable TOC contents (see SI Appendix) as there are no corresponding Hg enrichments (Fig. 4).

6. Discussion

6.1. Evaluating volcanism as a direct driver of Toarcian N-CIE Hg enrichments

Mercury data from the Panthalassa transect show that only the most proximal location (i.e., East Tributary) documents minor Hg enrichments (as compared to some values from Europe) in both [Hg] and Hg/TOC during the N-CIE (Figs. 3, 5, and 6). As Hg/TOC values increase during the N-CIE, there is a decrease in δ²⁰²Hg and Δ¹⁹⁹Hg (−0.5 to −1 and −0.1 to −0.2, respectively), which suggests that the source(s) or geochemical process(es) controlling local Hg deposition may have changed during the carbon isotope perturbation. As previously stated, there are currently several known mechanisms controlling Hg cycling. These include: volcanism, biomass burning, increased detrital inputs (rock weathering and soil loss), photoreactions, and/or some combination of the above (Fig. 2). The isotope results from the N-CIE interval are inconsistent with purely volcanic signatures which have Δ¹⁹⁹Hg near zero or more positive, and therefore, are more suggestive of a trend toward terrestrial sources (e.g., soils, plants, and peat, which have more negative Δ¹⁹⁹Hg values but slightly overlap; Fig. 2). Furthermore, the range of δ²⁰²Hg and Δ¹⁹⁹Hg values, along with the Hg/TOC anomaly, at this location is within the range of modern and pre-anthropogenic marine sediments (e.g., Gehre et al., 2009; Gleason et al., 2017 and references within). As such, the Hg in our samples suggests the enrichment mechanism is not sourced from direct volcanic emissions during the N-CIE. However, this result does not rule out terrestrial cycling of previously deposited
Fig. 3. Mercury geochemistry of the Alberta sections that represent a basin transect. Lithostratigraphy, chemostratigraphy, and ammonite biostratigraphy from Them et al. (2017a, 2018). Tenuicostatum = Tenuicostatum, carb. = carbonate. East Tributary represents proximal location; core 1-35-62-5W6 represents intermediate location; core 6-32-75-20W5 represents distal location. The proximal East Tributary section is the only section from our Panthalassan study sites that displays an anomaly in Hg/TOC values.
volcanogenic mercury. The recycling of terrestrial Hg is likely related to climatic feedbacks associated with volcanism that could have resulted in increased wildfires (e.g., Baker et al., 2017) and enhanced riverine loading of soil-derived Hg through increased weathering (e.g., Percival et al., 2016; Them et al., 2017b; Izumi et al., 2018). Additionally, at the East Tributary location, the T-OAE N-CIE interval is also associated with the increased deposition of sand-sized grains (e.g., Them et al., 2017a) and higher Al contents (e.g., Them et al., 2017b), which could be due to a local increase in detrital input from an enhanced hydrological cycle (e.g., Izumi et al., 2018). These isotope data are also similar in magnitude with previously published work for other Phanerozoic extinction events that show minor Δ^{199}Hg perturbations (e.g., Grasby et al., 2017; Wang et al., 2018). It must be noted, however, that the Hg isotope values of the multiple Hg sources overlap (Fig. 2); thus, caution is needed when interpreting these data alone to identify specific source(s) as continual shelf to nearshore environments likely record an amalgamation of these sources.

The Dotternhausen Quarry Hg/TOC data remain low during the T-OAE, with values only significantly fluctuating below the N-CIE (Fig. 4). The one-point Hg and Hg/TOC increase in the T-OAE interval is intriguing because it may represent an increase in volcanic activity. This sample, however, is associated with elevated pyrite contents and is likely controlled by local Hg cycling (see Supplemental Information). Notably, the fluctuating Hg/TOC values (0.05 to 0.17) prior to the N-CIE are similar in magnitude to several previous studies that attribute such fluctuations to volcanic activity (e.g., Percival et al., 2015; Scaife et al., 2017; Fantasia et al., 2018; many others). There is no change in [Hg], however, and therefore we suggest that the observed Hg/TOC values are driven by low and fluctuating TOC (<0.3%), which are also associated with lithologic changes (organic matter-lean carbonate marls from 0 to 2 m; Fig. 4). It is unlikely these Hg/TOC values are driven by local redox variability, as water column redox conditions are predominantly reducing (anoxic) for the investigated intervals at this location (e.g., Them et al., 2018; see Supplementary Information).

Diagenetic alteration of the primary Hg and TOC values could be a possible mechanism to explain the lack of Hg enrichment at Dotternhausen; we suggest, however, that it would be unlikely to have caused the observed Hg/TOC record. While the effects of diagenesis on Hg are relatively unknown, it is probable that Hg and TOC would be affected similarly if Hg is truly associated with organic matter, but could be incorporated in new mineral phases after dissolution in pore fluids. If the Hg and TOC are decoupled, however, then loss of TOC through thermal decomposition or other similar processes during burial may result in spurious Hg anomalies, which is more likely in localities with highly variable TOC.
This would be the case if Hg did not also volatilize at temperatures resulting in thermal decomposition of organic matter. The reverse is also true where loss of Hg through volatilization would result in a muted Hg/TOC signal if there was no organic matter loss during burial and heating. Although possible, there is no evidence to suggest that either of these scenarios resulted in the observed Hg/TOC values. Alternatively, the observed increases in Hg during the N-CIE interval are potentially associated with changes in the type of organic matter at this location (e.g., Schwark and Frimmel, 2004). Changing organic matter sources (i.e., prokaryotic vs. eu- karyotic, marine vs. terrestrial, etc.) and the subsequent effect on Hg sequestration is not constrained for any ancient deposits, and therefore moving forward will be an important parameter to constrain for the validity of the Hg proxy, especially for events with large, widespread climatic and biological perturbations.

Comparative lithologic variability (low TOC to TOC-rich sediments) and ranges of Hg/TOC values (0.14 to 0.4) to those observed at the Dotternhausen Quarry are also observed in a mid-Pleistocene sediment core from the Mediterranean Sea. The Hg and Hg/TOC anomalies are not linked to volcanic activity, but rather local redox variability and low TOC values (∼0.25%; e.g., Gehrke et al., 2009; see Fig. 4 and SI Figs. 1 and 2). This suggests that fluctuations of this magnitude are non-unique in the geological record and can be driven by local or regional Hg cycling.

All previously reported Toarcian N-CIE Hg/TOC anomalies occur in successions with low and/or variable TOC contents (see Percival et al., 2015 and Fantasia et al., 2018 for these values) and lithological variability (e.g., Percival et al., 2015; Fantasia et al., 2018; Fig. 5). Given this, caution should be used when interpreting Hg data from low TOC settings (i.e., carbonates, low-TOC siliciclastics, etc.) in the geological record (e.g., Grasby et al., 2016 set a lower limit of 0.2%). This was suggested to minimize false positives, and generally this approaches the lower limits of accuracy and precision for TOC measurements and therefore compromises Hg/TOC values.

To better constrain the spatiotemporal record of Hg during the Toarcian N-CIE we have compiled all published Toarcian N-CIE data (e.g., Percival et al., 2015, 2016; Fantasia et al., 2018; this study; Figs. 1 and 5). This new compilation documents two observations: [1] there is a clear proximity relationship to landmasses with Hg anomalies (Fig. 6), and [2] enrichments are asynchronous amongst these localities (Figs. 5 and 6). All of the locations recording Hg enrichments (6 out of 7), highlighted in blue, are in close proximity to landmasses (Mochras Borehole, Bornholm, Peniche, Arroyo Lapa, El Peñón, East Tributary; while Yorkshire is the exception with no Hg/TOC anomaly; Figs. 1, 5, and 6). The deepest and/or more distal sites have no Hg/TOC anomalies (0 out of 5; Sancerre core, Dotternhausen, Veletit core, and Alberta cores). This suggests that proximity to land may control the Hg content of marine sediments during the N-CIE, which is to be expected if the dominant source of Hg was terrestrial. This seems to contradict the idea that the atmosphere was the dominant, direct source of Hg during the N-CIE, which would be expected to deposit Hg more uniformly throughout the ocean as the atmospheric residence time is close to the mixing time for the hemisphere of emission (Fig. 2).

The Hg deposited across a landscape directly from the atmosphere via volcanic eruptions would also be expected to be redistributed/cycled during its transport within the intermediate reservoirs (i.e., plants and soils; Fig. 2) before reaching estuarine and marine sediments. Importantly, these reservoirs would have continued to host and cycle Hg long after its initial deposition (e.g., Driscoll et al., 2013; Amos et al., 2013; Zhu et al., 2018; Fig. 2). The increase of Hg from other terrestrial reservoirs (Fig. 2) could therefore mask any direct volcanic Hg signal. Thus, the pattern of the N-CIE Hg enrichments suggests that the observed Hg anomalies most likely reflect changes in regional riverine input. Furthermore,
Fig. 5. Compilation of sedimentary mercury geochemistry during the Pliensbachian and Toarcian. Lithostratigraphy, carbon-isotope (either organic or inorganic) and Hg/TOC chemostratigraphy across the Pliensbachian–Toarcian interval from Europe, South America, and North America. Blue text represents sites where an Hg/TOC anomaly occurred during the T-OAE interval. Red text represents sites where an Hg/TOC anomaly did not occur during the T-OAE interval.

These enrichments would continue well after the initial driver for climatic and environmental change ceased, potentially causing heterogeneity in the timing of Hg burial and enrichment in the sedimentary record (Amos et al., 2014; Fig. 5), an expected outcome of the propagation of some environmental signals to be preserved in marine sedimentary record (e.g., Romans et al., 2016).

Increased Hg inputs from rivers (e.g., Amos et al., 2014; Rice et al., 2009) through rock-weathering interactions, soil erosion, and/or biomass burning (e.g., Rice et al., 2009; Grasby et al., 2017) would heterogeneously impact Hg inputs in nearshore environments (e.g., Zhu et al., 2018). The idea of this process exerts an influence on the Toarcian record is supported by evidence that global climates became both warmer and wetter, with increased continental weathering, during the classical T-OAE interval (e.g., Dera and Donnadieu, 2012; Percival et al., 2016; Them et al., 2017b; Izumi et al., 2018). Following this idea, local delivery of Hg through rivers would most directly influence the observed Hg anomalies in proximal locations (e.g., Percival et al., 2015; Fantasia et al., 2018; this study). Furthermore, modern wildfires can increase the supply of Hg to surface waters and the atmosphere (e.g., Burke et al., 2010). Recent research suggests that a significant increase in sedimentary charcoal abundances is associated with the latter half of the N-CIE interval, indicative of increased wildfires (e.g., Baker et al., 2017), which could also enhance the input of Hg to the oceans on a local to regional scale (Fig. 2). Due to their unique accumulation pathways and preservation of Hg and TOC into sediments, one would not necessarily expect to observe increases in charcoal abundances and Hg or Hg/TOC at the same stratigraphic level. A similar relationship with wildfires was suggested for proximal Hg anomalies at the Latest Permian extinction (e.g., Grasby et al., 2017). The increase in Hg deposition from wildfire activity, the magnitude of which intensifies in a warming world (e.g., Pechony and Shindell, 2010), needs to be considered as a probable Hg source during other intervals of climatic upheaval.

The proximal locations that do record N-CIE Hg anomalies are not necessarily inconsistent with the interpretation that LIP volcanism resulted in these enrichments, but there are also asynchronous stratigraphic enrichments/depletions in Hg across the N-CIE interval (e.g., Percival et al., 2015; Fantasia et al., 2018; Fig. 5). It might be expected that an increase in volcanic-derived Hg would result in synchronous stratigraphic Hg enrichments at each location; the observation that Hg enrichments occur at different points in time (using correlations based on carbon isotope stratigraphy and the estimated duration of the 300–500 kyr for the N-CIE interval; e.g., Bouilla et al., 2014 and Sell et al., 2014) in specific locations suggests that local- and regional-scale processes exert a control on the resulting stratigraphic record of Hg (Fig. 5). Thus, the observed asynchronous stratigraphic Hg enrichments (or lack thereof) likely
Fig. 6. Idealized depositional settings of European, South American, and North American locations during Pliensbachian and Toarcian. (A) In the European epeiric sea, multiple semi-restricted to severely restricted basins and emergent landmasses existed. Note that this is not one continuous cross-section, thus it is not depicting the local restriction of the basin as they are connected to other sub-basins. (B) The two South American locations were directly adjacent to the Laurentian continent and the basins were isolated due to volcanic terranes. (C) The North American locations were located in an upwelling zone with strong connections to Panthalassa. The bottom panels depict the study sites with respective max [Hg] and Hg/TOC values during the T-OAE N-CIE interval, as well as their relative distance from any landmasses, small or large. Note that small changes in the relative distance of any study area will not significantly influence the observations. Blue text represents sites where an Hg/TOC anomaly occurred during the T-OAE interval. Red text represents sites where an Hg/TOC anomaly did not occur during the T-OAE interval. A north arrow is shown in each panel. Pan. = Panthalassa, E.E.S. = European epeiric seaway.

represent the influence of the local/regional cycling of Hg rather than the direct input of Hg from volcanicogenic emissions with potential relationships to source-to-sink sedimentary dynamics (e.g., Romans et al., 2016).

A striking observation is that there is no Hg/TOC anomaly during the N-CIE interval in the proximal Yorkshire location even though there are small Hg increases (e.g., Percival et al., 2015; Figs. 1, 5, and 6). The absence of a Hg/TOC increase at Yorkshire could be due to many reasons: re-cycling and re-emissions of Hg prior to sedimentation, post-depositional release of Hg due to local redox variability (e.g., Zhu et al., 2018), potential changes in organic matter source affecting Hg bioaccumulation, or water column stratification as is observed at this location (e.g., French et al., 2014). It may also be related to an early Toarcian sea level transgression. Regardless, there will be local deviations to the model put forth to explain the observed Hg/TOC anomalies during the N-CIE interval (Figs. 5 and 6), but it provides the most parsimonious explanation to-date.

6.2. Estimating the amount of mercury release across the T-OAE

It is difficult to quantify the release of mercury from the emplacement of ancient LIPs as there is no equivalent modern analog. A previous estimate by Percival et al. (2015) determined that 150 megatons (Mt) of Hg was released by the K–F LIP based on its size and using the modern Hg/SO2 emission values from volcanoes. This estimation is much less than the ~3800 Mt release of Hg estimated from the emplacement of the Siberian Traps across the Permo/Triassic boundary (e.g., Sanei et al., 2012). These calculations, however, are reasonable first attempts given the number of unconstrained parameters from these ancient LIPs. It is also possible, however, to quantify the increased fluxes of Hg to the ocean/atmosphere system from weathering and wildfires using the modern mass balance (Fig. 2). For example, if global weathering rates increased by approximately two-fold across the T-OAE (e.g., Them et al., 2017b) and global wildfire activity increased by three-fold (cf., Baker et al., 2017), an additional 210 Mt and 120 Mt of Hg, respectively, could be released above pre-
perturbation steady state from these two sources assuming a 300-kyr perturbation (e.g., Bouilla et al., 2014; Sell et al., 2014; Them et al., 2017b) and a modern mass balance (see Fig. 2). Thus, the potential for increased fluxes should be considered for Hg studies that are associated with other intervals of climatic perturbation and widespread environmental destabilization.

6.3. Mercury isotopes to fingerprint potential sources

As noted above, Hg can be cycled through multiple reservoirs, many of which have isotopic overlap, before it is eventually deposited in the sedimentary record (e.g., Blum et al., 2014; Fig. 2). In near-modern marine sediments, the observed range of paired Hg/TOC and MDF and MIF values (e.g., Blum et al., 2014; Gehlke et al., 2009; Gleason et al., 2017 and references within) is similar to the range observed in the Toarcian record as well as other events in the geologic record (e.g., Blum et al., 2014; Thibodeau et al., 2016; Yin et al., 2017; this study). Notably, these ancient $^{202}\text{Hg}$ and $^{199}\text{Hg}$ data also show less variation than those identified in a modern coastal plain sediment core, where the observed variations were interpreted as a combination of changes in sediment type, grain size, and/or Hg sources (e.g., Das et al., 2013). Although coastal plain biogeochemical processes are not directly analogous to a purely marine system, the potential control of grain size on Hg isotopes should remain ubiquitous in contrasting depositional settings. Furthermore, it has recently been suggested that a negative MIF signal in Mesoproterozoic black shales is indicative of photic zone euxinia (e.g., Zheng et al., 2018), which highlights the need to constrain the local redox when interpreting Hg records. Therefore, it is clear that challenges remain in the use of Hg isotopes to definitively pinpoint the overall global changes in the source(s) of Hg to ancient marine sedimentary rocks if there are significant lithological, grain size, and/or redox variations.

Despite these potential complications, compiled Hg isotope values from natural sources of Hg do show negative $^{199}\text{Hg}$ values reflecting many terrestrial reservoirs (i.e., plants, soils, rocks), and more positive $^{199}\text{Hg}$ values can be sourced from other terrestrial reservoirs (i.e., plants, soils, rocks) and volcanoes (e.g., Blum et al., 2014 and references within; Fig. 2). As described earlier for the data from the Toarcian, the trends in Hg/TOC anomalies (Figs. 1, 5, and 6) also suggest enhanced terrestrial sourcing of Hg in T-OAE Hg cycle. Moreover, it may be possible to more accurately interpret ancient Hg isotope records in geologic settings where local changes in the sedimentary environment are minimal during the interval studied (e.g., Das et al., 2013) as we have attempted to do so with the Toarcian Hg isotope data presented here from the East Tributary section.

7. Conclusions

Our new data, when cast in the context of the existing Pliensbachian and Toarcian Hg records, have major implications for the underlying mechanisms driving the Toarcian Hg anomalies. Environmental destabilization during the early Toarcian was most likely driven by multiple feedbacks associated with the emplacement of the Karoo–Ferrar LIP. Our compilation of Hg anomalies along with previous evidence for environmental destabilization during the Toarcian N-CIE suggests the following sequence of events: (1) Main phase emplacement of the Karoo–Ferrar LIP and injection of an unknown quantity of Hg to atmosphere from LIP emplacement; (2) Cycling and redistribution of this Hg in intermediate reservoirs (Fig. 2); (3) Increases in the Hg flux to marine environments from continental weathering, soil erosion, and wildfires; (4) Local changes in water column redox in some locations result in enhanced Hg deposition; (5) LIP emplacement decreases or ceases (or Hg input from volcanism decreases while volcanic activity continues) while enhanced Hg loading in proximal marine environments continues for some time, and biogeochemical cycles and the climate are still perturbed. Events 2–4 may occur geologically simultaneously but potentially independently from one another.

The trends from the Pliensbachian–Toarcian Hg compilation illustrate the need to generate similar records from other events in Earth’s history. Warming, weathering, wildfires, redox changes, and volcanism can all potentially affect sedimentary Hg enrichments and isotopic signatures. Despite these complexities in the interpretation of the ancient Hg record, we suggest that LIPs may have been the underlying driver of the observed environmental disturbances that resulted in some Hg anomalies and mass extinctions. Volcanism or LIPs may have introduced significant quantities of Hg to the ocean/atmosphere system, but there are many intermediate steps in the cycling of Hg prior to ultimate burial in the sedimentary record, and other larger reservoirs that respond to climatic perturbations may release Hg on similar timescales (Fig. 2). Therefore, the role of these other mechanisms needs to be considered when interpreting ancient Hg enrichments. To better identify these potential sources and feedbacks in the ancient Hg cycle it is imperative to investigate Hg records from both proximal and distal as well as shallow- and deep-water environments, and from multiple ocean basins with independent evidence for local redox conditions, when possible. Further calibration of the Hg system in modern settings (siliciclastic-dominated, carbonatedominated, proximal vs distal, fluctuating redox, etc.) will also sharpen our interpretations of the ancient Hg record.

Acknowledgements

TRT would like to thank the FSU Arts and Sciences Postdoctoral Fellowship for ability to conduct this project. The Alberta outcrop samples were collected under the following permits: #YHTR-2014-16156, #13-058, #14-009, and #15-019. CHJ was supported by Cooperative Agreement NA11SEC4810001 with NOAA’s Education Partnership with Minority-Serving Institutions. JDO acknowledges NSF grant OCE 1343785 and NASA Exobiology grant NNX16AJ60G. Ry was funded by the Chinese Academy of Sciences through the Pioneer Hundred Talent Plan. Manuscript preparation was performed at the National High Magnetic Field Laboratory and the College of Charleston. The National High Magnetic Field Laboratory is supported by National Science Foundation Cooperative Agreement No. DMR-1157490 and the State of Florida. We would also like to thank editor Derek Vance and Michael Hermoso and two anonymous reviewers whose suggestions and comments helped to improve this manuscript.

Competing interests

The authors declare no competing financial interests.

Appendix A. Supplementary material

Supplementary material related to this article can be found online at https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2018.11.029.

References


